IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA CHARLESTON DIVISION

IN RE: C. R. BARD, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION MDL NO. 2187

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ALL WAVE 3 CASES

PRETRIAL ORDER # 131 (Docket Control Order for Discovery of Certain Avaulta, Bard Only Cases – Wave 3)

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 1 states that the Rules "should be construed and administered to secure the just, speedy, and inexpensive determination of every action and proceeding." In the situation of large MDLs such as this one, courts often need to work creatively within the Rules in order to encourage the efficient resolution of cases.

I currently have more than 60,000 unique cases in seven different MDLs. This is twelve times the total number of civil trials conducted in the United States Federal District Courts last year. From October 1, 2012 through September 30, 2013, District Courts conducted 5,027 civil trials. *See* Table T-1, U.S. District Courts—Civil and Criminal Trials Completed by District, United States Courts (2013), *available at* http://www.uscourts.gov/uscourts/Statistics/JudicialBusiness/2013/appendices/T01Sep13.pdf. Of these, 2,025 were jury trials. *See id.* The number of cases in this MDL alone well exceeds this number.

According to legislative history, the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation ("JPML") was created "to provide formal machinery to transfer, for coordinated or consolidated pretrial procedures, civil actions pending in different judicial districts, that have one or more common questions of fact." S. Rep. No. 454, at 3 (1967). The creation of the JPML was a response to a

wave of antitrust litigation related to electrical equipment manufacturers in the 1960s. *See id.* In the 1960s,

[i]n little more than 12 months['] time, almost 2,000 cases involving more than 25,000 separate claims for relief were filed in 35 Federal judicial districts from coast to coast. The pretrial discovery problems created by this wave of cases placed a heavy burden on the Federal courts, and it was apparent to the judiciary that unless some special action was taken these cases would engulf the courts with continually conflicting pretrial discovery demands for the same witnesses and documents.

- *Id.* The Judicial Conference of the United States created the Coordinating Committee for Multiple Litigation of the United States District Courts. *See id.* "The Coordinating Committee recognized that extraordinary procedures would have to be adopted if these cases were to be processed in a manner that was both orderly and avoided a waste of judicial manpower." *Id.* The following steps were taken in order to streamline the litigation:
 - 1. The Coordinating Committee recommended a schedule of pretrial discovery proceedings and a series of uniform pretrial and discovery orders covering common issues of fact. This recommended schedule was accepted by the district courts involved and, after consultation with the lawyers for the parties, the judges of the district courts entered the uniform orders.
 - 2. National depositions were held, attended by large numbers of plaintiffs' and defendants' counsel. Lead counsel, chosen by the lawyers for the plaintiffs and defendants, propounded questions on behalf of all the parties. Other attorneys present, however, were given the opportunity to ask additional questions to protect their particular interests. Arrangements were made for the additional deposition of any witness if the need arose.
 - 3. Central document depositories were established, one for plaintiffs and another for defendants. Close to 1 million documents were filed at the depositories, and made available for copying by the parties. This arrangement minimized inconvenience and expense.

Id. at 3-4.

I now have more than 30,000 times the number of cases that spurred Congress to establish the JPML. Extraordinary procedures are once again necessary in order to move the

cases forward. To date, C. R. Bard, Inc. ("Bard") and the plaintiffs in this MDL have made little progress in working towards resolution of this MDL, which was assigned to me in 2010 and now has over 9,000 cases. I have conducted multiple status conferences, meetings with counsel, one bellwether trial, ordered the completion of a census sheet, and scheduled other bellwether trials which did not take place. Most recently, I ordered discovery and motion practice in two hundred cases (Wave 1 and 2). Upon completion, I will remand those cases back to their home districts.

With so little progress to date, I find it necessary to take additional steps in this MDL. In this third, larger wave, I will order limited and clearly defined pretrial discovery, decide any summary judgment and *Daubert* motions and remand these cases back to their home districts where I will make every effort to see that they are expeditiously set for trial. This is the third in what will be a continuing series of waves.

There are a number of issues common to each of the cases, and it is pointless to require the parties to repeatedly duplicate their work. Considering the needs of each case and the sophistication of the attorneys involved, there are discovery procedures which the court believes are necessary and appropriate that can be implemented in order to streamline the litigation process.

It is **ORDERED** that in the cases listed in Exhibit A, hereinafter referred to as "Wave 3," the plaintiffs and Bard shall comply with the deadlines and other provisions outlined below:

A. CONFIRMATION OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR INCLUSION IN WAVE 3

1. On or before **August 6, 2014,** both sides must jointly file a list identifying any cases on Exhibit A in which the most current Short Form or Amended Short Form

¹ The three remaining bellwether cases in the Bard MDL were either dismissed or settled before or on the eve of trial.

Complaint identifies a defendant in addition to Bard OR a product other than the following Avaulta products ((1) Avaulta Plus Anterior Support System; (2) Avaulta Plus Posterior Support System; (3) Avaulta Solo Anterior Synthetic Support System; and (4) Avaulta Solo Posterior Synthetic Support System), such that it is not appropriately included for work up in Wave 3. This list should indicate the case name, number and defect² and be filed in MDL 2187. On or before **August 8, 2014**, the court will determine whether any case on the contested list filed by the parties should be removed from Wave 3 and will file an order to that effect. Thereafter, the court will instruct the Clerk to mark the remaining individual cases as Wave 3 cases.

B. FACT DISCOVERY

- 1. Plaintiff Fact Sheets, Authorizations and Defendant Fact Sheets.
 - a. Plaintiff Fact Sheet. On or before August 29, 2014, plaintiffs shall provide Plaintiff Fact Sheets ("PFS") and executed authorizations for all Wave 3 Cases. Authorizations shall be provided in accordance with the requirements of PTO # 69.
 - b. Plaintiff's Medical Records. To increase efficiency, plaintiffs shall timely provide Bard with copies of all medical records that are in their attorneys' possession as of the date of this Order. Such records must be received by counsel for Bard no more than 10 business days after the deadline for service of the Plaintiff Fact Sheet.

² I will not remove a case from the list simply because Bard asserts that the case involves a non-Avaulta product or multiple manufacturers when the Short Form Complaint or Amended Short Form Complaint indicates otherwise or because the Short Form Complaint has not been timely served. The parties must either jointly agree to the removal of these cases from this wave or litigate these issues.

- c. If a plaintiff fails to provide a substantially completed PFS or executed authorizations by the deadline applicable to that action, Bard has the option to file a motion for the entry of an Order to Show Cause why the case should not be dismissed with prejudice.
- d. PTO # 121 (Stipulated Evidence Preservation Protocol for Potential Trial
 Selection Cases) shall apply pending further order of the court.
- e. **Defendant's Fact Sheet.** On or before **September 19, 2014**, Bard shall provide a Defendant Fact Sheet ("DFS") for all Wave 3 Cases.

2. Depositions.³

- must be completed by no later than **October 17, 2014**. The deposition of the lead plaintiff in each case may not exceed two (2) hours for direct examination and one (1) hour for cross-examination. The deposition of any spouse making a consortium claim may not exceed one (1) hour for direct-examination and thirty (30) minutes for cross-examination. The parties are encouraged to coordinate the locations for and the taking of such depositions. I urge the parties to consider entering into agreements to take multiple plaintiffs' depositions at the same time and location where the deponents reside in the same geographic region.
- b. **Treating physicians (implanting, explanting physicians)**. It is impractical for the parties to orally depose each and every treating physician in these

The depositions of a plaintiff's friends and family members need not be completed by the deadline for the completion of fact discovery. Such depositions may be taken at any time prior to trial provided the deposition is requested before the deadline for completing fact discovery. These depositions are limited to one (1) hour for direct examination and thirty (30) minutes for cross-examination.

cases. There are 298 cases in Wave 3, and if Bard deposed three (3) treating physicians for a total of seven (7) hours each, these depositions would last a total of 6,258 hours. While Rule 31(a)(2) does not fully apply to the situation at hand, the court finds that its provisions for depositions by written questions provide a means by which some efficiency may be achieved in collecting the necessary information from the treating physicians given the unique set of circumstances in this MDL, the distinct directive provided in Rule 1 and the flexibility suggested by Rule 26.

- i. In each case, Bard may serve no more than thirty (30) written deposition questions per treating physician by no later than **October 31, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **November 14, 2014**.
- ii. Plaintiffs' cross-questions (limited to twenty (20)) may be served no later than **November 17, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **December 1, 2014**.
- iii. Bard's redirect questions (limited to ten (10)) may be served no later **December 3, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **December 10, 2014**.

c. Sales Representatives.

i. In each case, plaintiffs may serve no more than ten (10) written deposition questions per sales representative by no later than **October 31**, **2014**; responses must be served no later than **November 14**, **2014**.

- ii. Bard's cross-questions (limited to five (5)) may be served no later than **November 17, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **December 1, 2014**.
- iii. Plaintiffs' redirect questions (limited to three (3)) may be served no later **December 3, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **December 10, 2014**.
- d. Corporate and non plaintiff-specific fact discovery. Rule 30(b)(6) depositions may not exceed two (2) hours for direct examination and one (1) hour for cross-examination. Plaintiffs are limited to five (5) Rule 30(b)(6) witnesses. Plaintiffs must choose a lead questioner. If a corporate witness has been previously deposed in this MDL litigation, the parties shall attempt to agree on whether a second deposition should occur, and if so, the parameters of the deposition. Nothing in this Docket Control Order should be construed to abridge a party's right to seek a protective order as to any appropriate issue on any available ground. All other non plaintiff-specific fact discovery shall be completed by written deposition and be limited to five (5) questions per side; three (3) cross-questions per side and two (2) redirect.
- e. All fact discovery must be completed by **December 5, 2014**.
- f. The court will permit additional fact discovery where a party specifically describes the additional discovery and shows good cause for the taking of such discovery in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

C. EXPERT DISCOVERY ON AVAULTA PRODUCTS

- 1. Expert Discovery and Reports. The parties may conduct general and specific expert discovery on the Avaulta products at issue in Wave 3. In light of the bellwether trial that already occurred on the Avaulta Plus Posterior Support System and the substantial discovery conducted to date on the other Avaulta products, the parties are cautioned not to engage in duplicative general expert discovery, but instead, to tailor their discovery to the remaining Avaulta products at issue (to the extent such discovery is necessary), supplementing any discovery already completed and conducting specific causation discovery for the Wave 3 plaintiffs. In light of the common products involved in this wave, the likelihood of overlap in expert opinion from one case to another (except as to specific causation) and the need to streamline discovery in these cases, each side is limited to no more than three (3) experts per case (exclusive of treating physicians). It is the court's expectation that these experts will overlap for plaintiffs who have the same product(s), to some extent, if not entirely.
 - a. In each case, the parties shall serve (i) expert disclosures pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(A) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(C), and (ii) expert reports pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(B).
 - Absent good cause shown, plaintiffs shall serve expert disclosures and reports in each case on or before October 20, 2014.
 - c. Absent good cause shown, Bard shall serve expert disclosures and reports in each case on or before **November 20, 2014**.

- d. The parties shall serve disclosures and reports for rebuttal expert witnesses, if any, by no later than **November 26, 2014**.
- e. Absent good cause shown, expert discovery shall be completed by no later than **December 5, 2014**.
- f. The court will permit additional expert discovery where a party specifically describes the additional discovery and shows good cause for the taking of such discovery in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

2. Expert Depositions.

- a. General Causation Expert Depositions. The parties shall coordinate the depositions of general causation experts. Insofar as multiple plaintiffs have utilized the same general causation expert or experts, those experts shall be deposed only once on the issue of general causation. As to Bard's experts, plaintiffs are instructed to choose a lead questioner.
- b. Specific Causation Expert Depositions. The opinions of experts regarding their specific causation opinions for individual plaintiffs shall be obtained by written deposition as follows:
 - i. Bard may serve no more than thirty (30) written deposition questions per expert by no later than **October 25, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **November 10, 2014**.
 - ii. Plaintiffs' cross-questions (limited to twenty (20)) may be served no later than **November 13, 2014**; responses must be served no later than **November 28, 2014**.

- iii. Bard's redirect questions (limited to ten (10)) may be served no later November December 1, 2014; responses must be served no later than December 10, 2014.
- c. Absent good cause shown, expert discovery shall be completed by no later than December 5, 2014.

D. Motion Practice.

- 1. *Daubert* Motion Practice. To the extent the parties are able to file identical *Daubert* motions in multiple cases or groups of cases, they are encouraged to do so. The parties must file such omnibus motion(s) in each Wave 3 case to which it applies. Insofar as there are case-specific and/or omnibus *Daubert* motions in the individual cases, such motions are due December 17, 2014. Responses are due January 2, 2015. Replies are due January 9, 2015.
- 2. Non *Daubert* Based Dispositive (or partially dispositive) Motion Practice. Non *Daubert* based dispositive (or partially dispositive) motions also can be streamlined by grouping motions by issue and/or State. The parties are encouraged to file omnibus motions where common issues are involved in multiple cases or groups of cases. If the parties file such motions, the parties are directed to file in each Wave 3 case in which the motion applies. Individual and/or omnibus motions are due December 17, 2014. Responses are due January 5, 2015. Replies are due January 12, 2015.
- 3. Daubert Based Dispositive Motion Practice. Daubert based dispositive motions are due February 12, 2015. Responses are due February 19, 2015. No reply briefs shall be filed for Daubert-based dispositive motions.

- 4. **Motions in Limine**. Motions in Limine may be filed only upon leave of court based on a showing of specific need for that particular issue to be determined prior to trial. In the event the court grants leave, motions are limited to 3 pages each, responses are limited to 2 pages each. No reply briefs shall be filed for motions in limine.
- 5. Dates for hearings on motions, if any, will be set at a future status conference.
- 6. Page limitations. If the parties file omnibus motions related to multiple cases or groups of cases, I will not impose additional page limits beyond those contained in the court's Local Rules of Civil Procedure 7.1(a)(2). The parties shall provide courtesy copies to the court in accordance with Local Civil Rule 7.1(a)(5), and requests that such courtesy copies include the header added upon filing. If a motion (other than a motion in limine) does not apply to more than one case, the court imposes the following deadlines: the memorandum in support of the motion is limited to five (5) double spaced pages; the response is limited to three (3) double spaced pages; and the reply is limited to two (2) double spaced pages.
- 7. Placeholder Exhibits. In the past, the court has permitted parties to file placeholder exhibits in support of *Daubert*, dispositive and other motions, responses and replies in the place of confidential documents that may be sealed and then, within five days, redact/dedesignate the documents or file a motion to seal. Moving forward, the court will no longer permit this practice. Parties may no longer file placeholder exhibits. The court expects leadership counsel for plaintiffs and Bard to resolve issues related to confidential designations well before the filing of the above motions. Filings containing placeholder exhibits will be struck. In the event there are issues related to sealing of confidential documents that the parties are unable to resolve, they

must be brought to the court's attention in a consolidated manner as follows: Any consolidated motion to seal is due on or before **November 3, 2014**, any response is due **November 10, 2014**, and any reply is due **November 14, 2014**.

E. CASES READY FOR TRANSFER, REMAND OR TRIAL.

- 1. By no later than **September 15, 2014**, the parties shall meet and confer concerning the appropriate venue for each of the cases, and the parties shall submit venue recommendations to the court, either jointly or separately, by **September 22, 2014**. The parties' recommendation(s) shall identify the cases about which the recommended venue is and is not in dispute. In accordance with PTO # 51, the court may then request briefing concerning the venue for those cases about which the parties disagree. Each party reserves the right to object to the venue selected by its adversary or the court.
- 2. At the conclusion of pre-trial proceedings, the court, pursuant to PTO # 51 and 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a), will transfer each directly-filed case to a federal district court of proper venue as defined in 28 U.S.C. § 1391. In the alternative, pursuant to PTO # 51 and 28 U.S.C. § 1407, cases that were transferred by the JPML shall be remanded for further proceedings to the federal district court from which each such case was initially transferred.
- 3. If a case is to be tried in the United States District Court for the Southern District of West Virginia (either by agreement of the parties or where venue in the Southern District is determined to be proper by the court), the case shall be deemed trial-ready as soon as discovery is completed and the court rules on the parties' motions in limine and non dispositive *Daubert* motions. The trial date for cases transferred or remanded

to other federal district courts shall be set by the judge to whom the transferred or

remanded case is assigned (including the undersigned through intercircuit

assignment).

The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to file a copy of this order in 2:10-md-02187 and it shall

apply to each member related case previously transferred to, removed to, or filed in this district,

which includes counsel in all member cases up to and including civil action number 2:14-cv-

24161. In cases subsequently filed in this district, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be

provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each new action at the time of filing of the

complaint. In cases subsequently removed or transferred to this court, a copy of the most recent

pretrial order will be provided by the clerk to counsel appearing in each new action upon

removal or transfer. It shall be the responsibility of the parties to review and abide by all pretrial

orders previously entered by the court. The orders may be accessed through the CM/ECF system

or the court's website at www.wvsd.uscourts.gov.

ENTER: July 31, 2014

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

13

| HIBIT A | | | |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------|---|---|
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Amaral, Sophie | 2:12-cv-01374 | Amaral, Sophie v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Anapol Schwartz |
| Leasure, Linda | 2:12-cv-07921 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01374 Leasure, Linda et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Anapol Schwartz |
| Marinelli, Donna Gaye | 2:13-cv-06281 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07921 Marinelli, Donna, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Mounce, Lena M | 2:13-cy-06285 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06281 Mounce, Lena M v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Baker, Nancy | 2:13-cv-08161 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06285 Baker, Nancy et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Michael, Margery | 2:13-cv-12996 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-08161 Michael, Margery, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Keen, Dianne | 2:13-cv-14777 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-12996 Keen, Dianne v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC Southern District of West | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Herpich, Rae Lynn | 2:13-cv-29274 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-14777 Herpich, Rae Lynn, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC Southern District of | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Silvidi, Angela | 2:13-cv-23274 2:13-cv-33123 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-29274 Silvidi, Angela v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC Southern District of West | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Davis, Gailya | 2:13-cv-33123 2:13-cv-33153 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-33123 Davis, Gailya v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC Southern District of West | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| | 2:13-cv-33805 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-33153 Sprott, Lorelei v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | |
| Sprott, Lorelei | | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-33805 Prochaska, Kimberly et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Prochaska, Kimberly | 2:14-cv-01085 | District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-01085 Steinhoff, Teri et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Andrus Wagstaff, PC |
| Steinhoff, Teri | 2:14-cv-02922 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-02922 Mietus, Donna v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Andrus Wagstaff, PO Andrus Wagstaff, PO |
| Mietus, Donna | 2:13-cv-32498 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-32498 Crawford, Denise et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | |
| Crawford, Denise | 2:13-cv-27822 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-27822 Vandeputte v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashcraft & Gerel LL Aylstock, Witkin, Krei |
| Vandeputte, Karen | 2:11-cv-00769 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00769 Schwendimann et al v C. R. Bard Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis |
| Schwendimann, Gypsy | 2:12-cv-00133 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00133 | Overholtz, PLLC |
| Grady, Doris | 2:12-cv-01807 | Grady v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01807 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Carmouche, Lee | 2:12-cv-01946 | Carmouche, Lee v C R Bard, Inc, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01946 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Scoma, Johna | 2:12-cv-04896 | Scoma, Johna v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-04896 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Cantrell, Tjawana | 2:12-cv-06894 | Cantrell, Tjawana et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-06894 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Dahill, Annetta | 2:12-cv-08153 | Dahill, Annetta v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08153 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Johns, Jeanette Louise | 2:12-cv-08527 | Johns, Jeanette Louise v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08527 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Marinelli, Donna Gaye | 2:12-cv-08629 | Marinelli, Donna Gaye v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cy-08629 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Messer, Cecil M. | 2:13-cv-03576 | Messer, Cecil M et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-03576 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Escalante, Hilda Yolanda | 2:13-cv-24754 | Escalante, Hilda Yolanda v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24754 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Hubbard, Jeannie Leasa | 2:13-cv-26229 | Hubbard, Jeanie Leasa et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-26229 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Dukich, Kim Kristine | 2:13-cv-29259 | Dukich, Kim Kristine v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-29259 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Mathewson, Lesa F. | 2:13-cv-30528 | Mathewson, Lesa F v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-30528 | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Pasqua, Sharon | 2:13-cv-30670 | Pasqua, Sharon v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Aylstock, Witkin, Krei Overholtz, PLLC |
| Pool, Shirley Maxine | 2:13-cv-31354 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-30670 Pool, Shirley Maxine v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-31354 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis Overholtz, PLLC |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|---------------------------|------------------|--|--|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Carter, Barbara Faye | 2:13-cv-34050 | Carter, Barbara Faye v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-34050 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC |
| StCyr, Janice L | 2:14-cv-02313 | St. Cyr, Janice L et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-02313 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC |
| Smallwood, Susia Pugh | 2:14-cv-03051 | Smallwood, Susia Pugh v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Kolar-Wichie, Marilyn Ann | 2:14-cv-03655 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-03051 Kolar-Wichie v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Manning, Kathy A | 2:14-cv-03662 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-03655 Manning, Kathy A v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| | 2:14-cv-03703 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-03662 Ramirez-Tarin, Luz v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Ramirez-Tarin, Luz | | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-03703 Roberts, Denise v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Roberts, Denise | 2:14-cv-03709 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-03709 Weisgerber v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Weisgerber, Ramona Marie | 2:14-cv-03757 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-03757 | Overholtz, PLLC |
| Strom, Carole | 2:14-cv-06563 | Strom, Carole v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-06563 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC |
| Guevara, Ana A. | 2:14-cv-06584 | Guevara, Ana A. et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-06584 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC |
| Linares, Irma | 2:14-cv-06835 | Linares, Irma v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-06835 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC |
| McQuaid, Hazel C. | 2:14-cv-06896 | McQuaid, Hazel C. v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-06896 | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC |
| Stanbrough, Kathleen | 2:14-cv-06937 | Stanbrough, Kathleen v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Velasquez, America | 2:14-cv-06959 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-06937 Velasquez, America v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | |
| Bittle, Mary Rose | 2:14-cv-16728 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-06959 Bittle, Mary Rose v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| Sutton, Sheila | 2:12-cv-00105 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-16728 Sutton v C. R. Bard Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Overholtz, PLLC Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & |
| · | | Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00105 Rueda, Olivia et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Overholtz, PLLC Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Rueda, Olivia | 2:13-cv-02175 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-02175 Huber, Karen v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Huber, Karen | 2:13-cv-02424 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-02424 | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C |
| Fredericks, Deanna Lynn | 2:13-cv-02976 | Fredericks, Deanna Lynn v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-02976 | Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C |
| Fitzanko, Coleen | 2:13-cv-06433 | Fitzanko, Coleen et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06433 | Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C |
| Jay, Laura | 2:13-cv-08536 | Jay, Laura et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-08536 | Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C |
| Sloan, Fern | 2:13-cv-22500 | Sloan, Fern et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-22500 | Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C |
| Williams, Geraldine | 2:13-cv-26458 | Williams, Geraldine et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Smitty, Martha L | 2:13-cv-33750 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-26458 Smitty, Martha L et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Rendeiro-Lontrao, Cynthia | 2:14-cv-00462 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-33750 Rendeiro-Lontrao, Cynthia v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Richards, Rhonda | 2:14-cv-00463 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-00462 Richards, Rhonda v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Lewis, Emma Lu | 2:14-cv-00475 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-00463 Lewis, Emma Lu et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| • | | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-00475 Callen, Doris H et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Callen, Doris H | 2:14-cv-14375 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-14375 Walker, Linda B et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Beasley, Allen, Crow, |
| Walker, Linda B | 2:13-cv-06550 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06550 Chaplin, Gail, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Chaplin, Gail | 2:10-cv-01211 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01211 | Ashley, P.C. |
| McNally, Janet | 2:10-cv-01215 | McNally et al v C. R. Bard Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginian, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-1215 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|---------------------|------------------|--|---|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| McCallan, Patricia | 2:10-cv-01216 | McCallan v C. R. Bard Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-1216 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Pete, Sally | 2:10-cv-01217 | Pete v C. R. Bard Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-1217 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Santillan, Beatrice | 2:10-cv-01219 | Santillan, Beatrice, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division 2:10-cv-01219 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Riley, Mary Lou | 2:10-cv-01220 | Riley v C. R. Bard Inc. et al., USCD, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-1220 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Huston, Kathryn | 2:10-cv-01223 | Huston et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01223 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Dalman, Jerry | 2:10-cv-01225 | Dalman v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01225 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Everly, Jeannie | 2:10-cv-01227 | Everly, Jeannie et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01227 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Tyson, Lucy | 2:10-cv-01228 | Tyson et al v C. R. Bard Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-1228 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Bargeron, Martha | 2:10-cv-01311 | Bargeron v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01311 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Blake, Aricia | 2:10-cv-01380 | Blake v. C.R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01380 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Cline, Barbara | 2:11-cv-00056 | Cline et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00056 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Hnilo, Elizabeth | 2:11-cv-00117 | Hnilo et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00117 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Gaby, Unavea | 2:11-cv-00119 | Gaby v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00119 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Lewis, Karen | 2:11-cv-00158 | Lewis et al v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00158 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Hoffman, Sandra | 2:11-cv-00161 | Hoffman et al v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00161 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Robbins, Susan | 2:11-cv-00162 | Robbins et al v C.R. Bard, Inc., et al, USCD, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00162 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Clark, Maryanne | 2:11-cv-00163 | Clark v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cy-00163 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Northern, Beulah | 2:11-cv-00198 | Northern v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-198 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Butcher, Marion | 2:11-cv-00231 | Butcher v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-CV-00231 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Fowler, Linda | 2:11-cv-00233 | Fowler v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cy-00233 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Grove, Kendra Sue | 2:11-cv-00271 | Grove et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00271 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Wade, Georgianna | 2:11-cv-00272 | Wade et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-272 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Patterson, Gloria | 2:11-cv-00294 | Patterson v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-294 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Goodwin, Margaret | 2:11-cv-00352 | Goodwin et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00352 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Matthews, Michelle | 2:11-cv-00355 | Matthews et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-355 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Vogt, Dorothy | 2:11-cv-00383 | Vogt v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-383 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Filley, Janice | 2:11-cv-00415 | Filley v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cy-00415 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Beasley, Glenda | 2:11-cv-00437 | Beasley, Glenda, et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00437 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Cash, Lynelle | 2:11-cv-00438 | Cash et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-CV-00438 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Anderson, Jeanette | 2:11-cv-00440 | Anderson v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00440 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Lindsey, Lorie | 2:11-cv-00539 | Lindsey et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-539 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|------------------------|------------------|--|---|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Kabatoff, Wanda | 2:11-cv-00578 | Kabatoff v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Kabaton, Wanda | 2.11-67-00376 | Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00578 Francis et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Francis, Dana | 2:11-cv-00588 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00588 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Crosby, Donna | 2:11-cv-00631 | Crosby et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Lulling Dalas | 2.11 00679 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00631 Jenkins, Ruby v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Jenkins, Ruby | 2:11-cv-00678 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00678 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Harshaw, Faye | 2:11-cv-00716 | Harshaw v C. R Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00716 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Tolbert, Janett | 2:11-cv-00756 | Tolbert et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00756 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Douglas, Gloria | 2:11-cv-00775 | Douglas v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00775 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Bartley, Patty | 2:11-cv-00787 | Bartley et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| G 11: A 1 | 2.11 00015 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00787 Sullivan et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Sullivan, Angela | 2:11-cv-00815 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00815 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Briggs, Cheryl | 2:11-cv-00898 | Briggs et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00898 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Stilwell, Barbara | 2:11-cv-00906 | Stilwell v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00906 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Sharp, Carolyn | 2:11-cy-00918 | Sharp et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| | | Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00918 Hicks et al. v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Hicks, Michele | 2:11-cv-00937 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00937 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Bennett, Betty Ann | 2:11-cv-01010 | Bennett et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-01010 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Ruffin, Sheila | 2:12-cv-00012 | Ruffin v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00012 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Kopp, Rose | 2:12-cv-00015 | Kopp et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00015 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Waggoner, Joan Irene | 2:12-cv-00016 | Waggoner et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cy-00016 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Duncan, Naomi | 2:12-cv-00035 | Duncan et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00035 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Kramer, Janet | 2:12-cv-00041 | Kramer v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00041 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Cadie, Patricia | 2:12-cv-00080 | Cadie et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00080 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Parker, Rhonda | 2:12-cv-00152 | Parker v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 1:12-cv-00020 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Gilbert, Ellen Mildred | 2:12-cv-00227 | Gilbert et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Ghoch, Ehen Whaled | 2.12-CV-00227 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00227 Waller et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Waller, Teresa | 2:12-cv-00233 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00233 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Zaleski, Patricia | 2:12-cv-00251 | Zaleski et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cy-00251 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| McKinnis, Delores | 2:12-cv-00260 | McKinnis v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00260 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Morales, Mary | 2:12-cv-00441 | Morales et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00441 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Hoagland, Kay | 2:12-cv-00992 | Hoagland v C. R, Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00992 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Adam, Nichole | 2:12-cv-01032 | Adam v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01032 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Brannon, Shelley | 2:12-cv-01035 | Brannon v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01035 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Bonita, Bev | 2:12-cv-01036 | Bonita v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01036 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Miles, Elizabeth | 2:12-cv-01114 | Miles v C. R. Bard et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01114 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|----------------------------|--------------------------------|--|---|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Lashier, Teresa | 2:12-cv-01155 | Lashier v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01155 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| McNeill, Carolyn | 2:12-cv-01157 | McNeill v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01157 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Stoffle, Nellie Ann | 2:12-cv-01159 | Stoffle, Nellie Ann et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01159 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Havens, Deborah | 2:12-cv-01160 | Havens et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01160 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Hoffman, Rhonda | 2:12-cv-01161 | Hoffman, Rhonda et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01161 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Mangram, Zena Elizabeth | 2:12-cv-01162 | Mangram v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01162 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Dotson, Lorea | 2:12-cv-01192 | Dotson et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01192 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Burket, Judith | 2:12-cv-01218 | Burket v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Housman, Wilma | 2:12-cv-01247 | Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01218 Housman v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Devore, Connie | 2:12-cv-01382 | Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01247 Devore et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Thompson, Shirley Mae (TN) | 2:12-cv-02510 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-01382 Thompson, Shirley Mae v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Sims, Eleanor M | 2:12-cv-03296 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02510 Sims, Eleanor M v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Lacher, Laura | 2:12-cv-03351 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-03296 Lacher, Laura et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Zgurski, Pamela J. | 2:12-cv-04555 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-03351 Zgurski, Pamela et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Walter, Wilma | 2:12-cv-05743 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-04555 Walter, Wilma et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Pressley, Doris Jean | 2:12-cv-05743 2:12-cv-06563 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-05743 Pressley, Doris et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Hatcher, Joyce E. | 2:12-cv-07033 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-06563 Hatcher, Joyce et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Powers, Linda S | 2:12-cv-07033 2:12-cv-07034 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07033 Powers, Linda v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| , | | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07034 Garrison, Virginia M v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Garrison, Virginia M | 2:13-cv-01843 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-01843 Maggert, Barbara Jean et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Maggert, Barbara Jean | 2:13-cv-01846 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-01846 Merrill, Julia Ann v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Merrill, Julia Ann | 2:13-cv-01856 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-01856 Richter, Barbara v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Richter, Barbara | 2:13-cv-06013 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06013 Rodriguez, Patricia Maria v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Ashley, P.C. |
| Rodriguez, Patricia Maria | 2:13-cv-06579 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06579 Ingram, Deborah Ann et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & |
| Ingram, Deborah Ann | 2:13-cv-07779 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-07779 Powell, Edythea Marie et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Ashley, P.C. |
| Powell, Edythea Marie | 2:13-cv-07781 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-07781 Pillow, Julia L. et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Ashley, P.C. |
| Pillow, Julia L. | 2:13-cv-07873 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-07873 | Ashley, P.C. |
| Senderling, Linda Carol | 2:13-cv-07928 | Senderling, Linda Carol v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-07928 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Hayes, Joda | 2:13-cv-07929 | Hayes, Joda v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-07929 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Wood, Joan C | 2:13-cv-24560 | Wood, Joan C et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24560 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Sapp, Judith | 2:13-cv-24561 | Sapp, Judith v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24561 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Herndon, Debora Lee | 2:13-cv-26832 | Herndon, Debora Lee v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-26832 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|-----------------------|------------------|---|--|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Hudson, Lynda Davis | 2:13-cv-28272 | Hudson, Lynda et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | 9 |
| Dvorak, Cheryl Renee | 2:13-cv-28428 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-28272 Dvorak, Cheryl Renee et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-28428 | Ashley, P.C. Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Doyle, Judith I | 2:13-cv-31407 | Doyle, Judith I v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-31407 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Hamilton, Barie | 2:14-cv-00507 | Hamilton, Barie et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-00507 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Drouin, Elsie J | 2:14-cv-00509 | Drouin, Elsie J v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-00509 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Giesler, Judith M | 2:14-cv-01629 | Giesler, Judith M v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-01629 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Hedberg, Diane E | 2:14-cv-01630 | Hedberg, Diane E et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-01630 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Ridgeway, Doris M | 2:14-cv-01634 | Ridgeway, Doris M v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-01634 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Romero, Mayra A | 2:14-cv-05623 | Romero, Mayra A et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-05623 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Conn, Juanita Kay | 2:14-cv-08390 | Conn, Juanita Kay et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-08390 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Scott, Janet Lee | 2:14-cv-10886 | Scott, Janet Lee et al v. C.R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-10886 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Leavine, Judy Ann | 2:14-cv-11566 | Leavine, Judy Ann, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11566 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Trammel, Kathy Joan | 2:14-cv-11568 | Trammel, Kathy Joan, v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11568 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Stanton, Victoria | 2:14-cv-11569 | Stanton, Victoria, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11569 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Stephens, Annie Merle | 2:14-cv-12043 | Stephens, Annie Merle et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-12043 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Miller, Wanda | 2:14-cv-12118 | Miller, Wanda J. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-12118 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| McVay, Anne | 2-10-cv-01218 | McVay, Anna, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cv-01218 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Adkins, Betty | 3:10-cv-00824 | Adkins, Betty v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Huntington Division, 3:10-cv-00824 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Ezell, Cindy | 2:10-cv-01212 | Ezell et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:10-cy-01212 | Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, P.C. |
| Fears, Dolores | 2:12-cv-02938 | Fears et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02938 | Blizzard & Nabers, LLP |
| Sesler, Shelia | 2:12-cv-02911 | Sesler, Shelia et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02911 | Chaffin Luhana LLP |
| Stauber, Ann | 2:12-cv-08741 | Stauber, Ann v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08741 | Chaffin Luhana LLP |
| Chaulklin, Diane | 2:12-cv-02615 | Chaulklin v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02615 | Childers, Schlueter & Smith, LLC |
| Soria, Lucy | 2:12-cv-02388 | Soria et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02388 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Durrant, Amy | 2:12-cv-02389 | Durrant, Amy et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02389 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Burnside, Henryetta | 2:12-cv-07071 | Burnside, Henryetta et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07071 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Meherg, Mildred | 2:12-cv-07072 | Meherg, Mildred et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07072 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Whaley, Sophia | 2:13-cv-10214 | Whaley, Sophia v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-10214 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Kile, Linda J | 2:13-cv-10421 | Kile, Linda J et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-10421 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Rojas, Dolores | 2:13-cv-24376 | Rojas, Dolores v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24376 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |
| Derickson, Eileen | 2:13-cv-25157 | Derickson, Eileen et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-25157 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. |

| (HIBIT A | | | |
|------------------------|------------------|---|--------------------------|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Lawhorne, Nancy D | 2:13-cv-29934 | Lawhorne, Nancy D et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Leiter, Gail H | 2:13-cv-30883 | Leiter, Gail H et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-30883 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Dilling, Traci | 2:13-cv-31927 | Dilling, Traci v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-31927 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Nickolaisen, Joan M. | 2:14-cv-02076 | Nickolaisen, Joan M. et al v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-02076 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Hassan, Gloria | 2:14-cv-04236 | Hassan, Gloria v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-04236 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Richardson, Roseline Y | 2:14-cv-05011 | Richardson, Roseline Y v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-05011 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G |
| Vigna, Stefanie | 2:14-cv-05021 | Vigna, Stefanie v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-05021 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Colletti, Joan | 2:14-cv-11534 | Colletti, Joan, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11534 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| McCarty, Bessy | 2:14-cv-11536 | McCarty, Bessy v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11536 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Albright, Eulonda | 2:14-cv-11540 | Albright, Eulonda, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11540 | Clark, Love & Hutson, G. |
| Roberts, Pamela | 2:14-cv-11542 | Roberts, Pamela, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Clark, Love & Hutson, G |
| Stasney, Rosa | 2:13-cv-11287 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11542 Stasney, Rosa v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Davis & Crump, P.C. |
| Mendoza, Angelyne | 2:13-cv-14766 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-11287 Mendoza, Angelyne v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Davis & Crump, P.C. |
| Hankemeier, Luann | 2:14-cv-15683 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-14766 Hankemeier, Luann v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Davis & Crump, P.C. |
| Knight, Sylvia | 2:14-cv-12399 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-15683 Knight, Sylvia v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Davis & Crump, P.C. |
| Schicker, Mary | 2:12-cv-02289 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-12399 Schicker, Mary et al v C. R. Bard, Inc et al, USDC, Southern District of | Fleming, Nolen, & Jez LI |
| Acosta, Maria T | 2:13-cv-06855 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02289 Acosta, Maria T et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Fleming, Nolen, & Jez Ll |
| Valadez, Roberta Lynn | 2:13-cv-12099 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06855 Valadez, Roberta Lynn et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Fleming, Nolen, & Jez Ll |
| Thacker, Chadley Ann | 2:13-cv-17057 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division Thacker, Chadley Ann et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Fleming, Nolen, & Jez Ll |
| Harless, Donna | 2:12-cv-06147 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-17057 Harless, Donna v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Fleming, Nolen, & Jez Ll |
| Harress, Donna | 2.12-64-00147 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-06147 Doyle, Mildred et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Foote, Meyers, Mielke |
| Doyle, Mildred | 2:12-cv-07923 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07923 | Flowers, LLC |
| Liddle, Suzanne | 2:13-cv-05545 | Liddle, Suzanne v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-05545 | Freese & Goss |
| Garcia, Rhonda K. | 2:13-cv-12023 | Garcia, Rhonda K. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., et al., U SDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, Case No. 2:13-cv-12023 | Freese & Goss |
| Reynolds, Betty J | 2:13-cv-18868 | Reynolds, Betty J v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-18868 | Freese & Goss |
| Syers, Susanne | 2:14-cv-01821 | Syers, Susanne v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-01821 | Freese & Goss |
| Durfee, Phylis | 2:14-cv-14844 | Durfee, Phylis v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-14844 | Freese & Goss |
| Schoenholtz, Alfreda | 2:14-cv-15210 | Schoenholtz, Alfreda v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-15210 | Freese & Goss |
| Taylor, Constance | 2:14-cv-15229 | Taylor, Constnace v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Freese & Goss |
| Tedford, Jerri | 2:14-cv-15231 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-15229 Tedford, Jerri et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14 cv, 15231 | Freese & Goss |
| Fowler, Melissa | 2:12-cv-02343 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-15231 Fowler v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Freese & Goss |
| Olivares, Jane | 2:13-cv-08474 | Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-02343 Olivares, Jane, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Hanly Conroy Bierstein |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|---------------------------|------------------|--|--|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Cooper, Donna | 2:13-cv-24931 | Cooper, Donna et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24931 | Heard, Robins, Cloud & Black, LLP |
| Hardy, Blanche | 2:13-cv-26567 | Hardy, Blanche et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-26567 | Heard, Robins, Cloud & Black, LLP |
| Walters, Vicki D. | 2:14-cv-08624 | Walters, Vicki D., et al.v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District Of West Virginia, Charleston Division | Heard, Robins, Cloud & Black, LLP |
| Johnson, Virginia | 2:13-cv-24230 | Johnson, Virginia v. C.R. Bard, Inc.,USDC, Southern District Of West Virginia Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24230 | Heard, Robins, Cloud & Black, LLP |
| Garcia, Maria Guadalupe B | 2:12-cv-08082 | Garcia, Maria Guadalupe v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08082 | Kline & Specter |
| Paxton-Collis, Joy Anne | 2:13-cv-27639 | Paxton-Collis, Joy Anne et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-27639 | Kline & Specter |
| Beer, Rebecca | 2:13-cv-30586 | Beer, Rebecca v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-30586 | Kline & Specter |
| Nolan, Sharon | 2:13-cv-31822 | Nolan, Sharon, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., et al., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-31822 | Kline & Specter |
| Morris, Kay | 2:13-cv-32898 | Morris, Kay et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-32898 | Kline & Specter |
| Carr, Patricia | 2:13-cv-32906 | Carr, Patricia et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-32906 | Kline & Specter |
| Rodriguez, Ramonita | 2:13-cv-33422 | Rodriguez, Ramonita et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-33422 | Kline & Specter |
| Gray, Janet | 2:12-cv-08078 | Gray, Janet v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08078 | Kline & Specter |
| Harrison, Susan | 2:12-cv-06602 | Harrison, Susan et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-06602 | Levin Simes LLP |
| Yorio, Cornelia | 2:12-cv-06643 | Yorio, Cornelia et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-06643 | Levin Simes LLP |
| Charbonnier, Marcellina | 2:13-cv-18823 | Charbonnier, Marcellina v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-18823 | Levin Simes LLP |
| Sherrill, Cheryl | 2:12-cv-07792 | Sherrill, Cheryl v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-07792 | Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, Mitchell, Raffert & Proctor, |
| Yates, Darla | 2:13-cv-00197 | Yates, Darla v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, |
| Crowley, Cynthia | 2:14-cv-12413 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-00197 Crowley, Cynthia v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-12413 | Mitchell, Raffert & Proctor, Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, Mitchell, Raffert & Proctor, |
| Rogers, Irene | 2:14-cv-17302 | Rogers, Irene v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West | Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, |
| Debronkart, Pamela J | 2:13-cv-02824 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-17302 Debronkart, Pamela J v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District | Mitchell, Raffert & Proctor, Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, |
| Hannahs, Danielle | 2:14-cv-07326 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-02824 Hannahs, Danielle, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., et al., USDC, Southern | Mitchell, Raffert & Proctor, Lockridge Grindal Nauen |
| Pushor, Shirley T | 2:13-cv-06002 | District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-07326 Pushor, Shirley v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West | P.L.L.P. Motley Rice LLC |
| Harris, Martha Rachel | 2:13-cv-09586 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-06002 Harris, Martha Rachel et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | Motley Rice LLC |
| Winn, Roberta L | 2:13-cv-29802 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-09586 Winn, Roberta L et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District | Motley Rice LLC |
| Hanna | 2:14-cv-10944 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-29802 Hanna et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | Robinson Calcagnie Robinson |
| Lopez-Sonzogni, Judy | 2:13-cv-27757 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-10944 Lopez-Sonzogni, Judy v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Shapiro Davis, Inc. Robinson, Calcagnie, |
| Scott-Treat, Cynthia | 2:13-cv-27751 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-27757 Scott-Treat, Cynthia et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | Robinson, Shapiro, Davis, Inc. Robinson, Calcagnie, |
| Mackie, Terri T | 2:12-cv-08865 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-27751 Mackie, Terri T et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern Disctrict of | Robinson, Shapiro, Davis, Inc. Simmons, Browder, Gianaris, |
| Gates, Patricia | 2:12-cv-08372 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08865 Gates v C. R Bard Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | Angelides & Barnerd, LLC Simmons, Browder, Gianaris, |
| Wilson, Sandra W | 2:13-cv-11258 | Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-08372 Wilson, Sandra W v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | Angelides & Barnerd, LLC The Bell Law Firm, PLLC |
| Graham, Deborah D | 2:12-cv-09691 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-11258 Graham, Deborah D et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | The Lanier Law Firm, PC |
| | | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-09691 | |

| HIBIT A | | | |
|------------------------|------------------|--|------------------------|
| | | | |
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style Kimbrough, Inez Hook et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Kimbrough, Inez Hook | 2:13-cv-08124 | District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-08124 | The Lanier Law Firm, F |
| Davis, Janet Louise | 2:13-cv-21386 | Davis, Janet Louise v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-21386 | The Lanier Law Firm, F |
| Lambert, Laura C | 2:13-cv-22373 | Lambert, Laura v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-22373 | The Lanier Law Firm, I |
| Burton, Diana Lee | 2:12-cv-05983 | Burton, Diana Lee v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-05983 | The Lanier Law Firm, I |
| Devere, Mary Magdalene | 2:12-cv-03017 | Devere, Mary v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-03017 | The Monsour Law Fire |
| Fletcher, Glennis | 2:13-cv-04014 | Fletcher, Glennis et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-04014 | The Moody Law Firm |
| Fournier, Renee | 2:11-cv-00632 | Fournier v C.R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00632 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Post, Janet | 2:11-cv-00635 | Post v C. R. Bard, Inc., et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00635 | The Potts Law Firm, Ll |
| Cannon, Carolyn | 2:11-cv-00790 | Cannon v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00790 | The Potts Law Firm, Ll |
| Watts, Dorothy | 2:11-cv-00835 | Watts et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Hoober, Elaine | 2:11-cv-00836 | Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00835 Hoober et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Barnes, Lois | 2:11-cv-00838 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00836 Barnes v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Johnston, Paulette | 2:11-cv-00973 | Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00838 Johnston v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, | The Potts Law Firm, L. |
| Perron, Dorothy | 2:12-cv-00164 | Charleston Division, 2:11-cv-00973 Perron v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00164 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Baugh, Ladora | 2:12-cv-00212 | Baugh et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-00212 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Harris-Jones, Linda | 2:13-cv-02287 | Harris-Jones, Linda et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Divsion, 2:13-cv-02287 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Oakley, Linda | 2:13-cv-13578 | Oakley, Linda et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-13578 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Moore, Betty J | 2:13-cv-21863 | Moore, Betty J et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-21863 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Robles, Martha | 2:13-cv-22376 | Robles, Martha et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-22376 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Hewitt, Amy | 2:13-cv-22386 | Hewitt, Amy et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Beard, Susan Marie | 2:13-cv-24967 | Virginia, Charleston Division Beard, Susan Marie v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24967 | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Davis, Ressie A. | 2:13-cv-24969 | Davis, Ressie A. v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Pingel, Julie L | 2:13-cv-24977 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24969 Pingel, Julie L. v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Bandy, Sylvia | 2:13-cv-25799 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-24977 Bandy, Sylvia v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L. |
| McGee, Susan | 2:13-cv-25809 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-25799 McGee, Susan v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L. |
| Cleveland, Peggy Sue | 2:13-cv-29737 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-25809 Cleveland, Peggy Sue et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Sovern, Sharon | 2:14-cv-04409 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-29737 Sovern, Sharon, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Lewis, Hazel L | 2:14-cv-04421 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-04409 Lewis, Hazel L v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West | The Potts Law Firm, L. |
| DeMarcus, Cassandra | 2:14-cv-15997 | Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-04421 DeMarcus, Cassandra et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District | The Potts Law Firm, L |
| Katsiafas, Gladys E | 2:13-cv-13586 | of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-15997 Katsiafas, Gladys E v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of | The Wilner Firm, P.A |
| Chirino, Juliet D | 2:13-cv-24515 | West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-13586 Chirino, Juliet D et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of | The Wilner Firm, P.A |

| EXHIBIT A | | | |
|-------------------------|------------------|---|---|
| Plaintiff | Civil Action No. | Case Style | Plaintiff's Firm |
| Acuff, Shirley M | 2:13-cv-27643 | Acuff, Shirley M et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-27643 | The Wilner Firm, P.A. |
| Rogers, Hilda A | 2:14-cv-11998 | Rogers, Hilda A et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-11998 | The Wilner Firm, P.A. |
| Wydner, Joyce Elouise | 2:12-cv-03273 | Wydner, Joyce et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:12-cv-03273 | Wexler Wallace, L.L.P. |
| Grzelak, Frances | 2:13-cv-22158 | Grzelak, Frances v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division; 2:13-cv-22158 | Wexler Wallace, L.L.P. |
| Carroll, Margaret | 2:13-cv-10925 | Carroll, Margaret et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-10925 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Johnson-Swan, Lynn | 2:13-cv-10929 | Johnson-Swan, Lynn et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-10929 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Nix, Billie Sure | 2:13-cv-14011 | Nix, Billie Sure v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-14011 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Dayhoff, Jeana | 2:13-cv-14021 | Dayhoff et al. v. C. R. ard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-14021 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Arnold, Linda Sue | 2:13-cv-14022 | Arnold, Linda S et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-14022 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Reilly, Kim | 2:13-cv-15149 | Reilly, Kim, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-15149 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| McClung, Linda | 2:13-cv-28843 | McClung, Linda v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-28843 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Sammons, Linda | 2:13-cv-31673 | Sammons, Linda v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-31673 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Rourke, Phyllis Jean | 2:13-cv-32667 | Rourke, Phyllis Jean et al v C. R. Bard, Inc. et al, USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-32667 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Ramkalawn-Sinanan, Chan | 2:14-cv-12603 | Ramkalawn-Sinanan, Chan, et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., et al., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-12603 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Massengill, JoAnn | 2:14-cv-14259 | Massengil, JoAnn v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-14259 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Romero, Mary | 2:14-cv-17541 | Romero, Mary v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-17541 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Harrison, Judy L | 2:14-cv-17862 | Harrison, Judy L., et al. v. C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:14-cv-17862 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Green, Constance | 2:13-cv-10928 | Green, Constance et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-10928 | Williams, Kherkher, Hart, Boundas, LLP |
| Deprosse, Michelle L. | 2:13-cv-09080 | Deprosse, Michelle L. et al v C. R. Bard, Inc., USDC, Southern District of West Virginia, Charleston Division, 2:13-cv-09080 | Wilson Law, PA |