

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

CHAMBERS OF
ROBERT B. KUGLER
DISTRICT JUDGE

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
POST OFFICE BOX 2797
CAMDEN, NJ 08101

14 August 2019

Via ECF

Mr. Seth Goldberg
DUANE MORRIS LLP
30 South 17 Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103-4196

Mr. Adam M. Slater
MAZIE SLATER
KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC
103 Eisenhower Parkway
Roseland, NJ 07068

Re: *In re: Valsartan Products Liability Litigation* **Civil Action No:** 1:19-md-2875
This Letter Applies to All Actions

Su: Request to Brief Motions to Dismiss to Narrow the Scope of the Case and Discovery

Dear Counsel:

Thank you for your well thought out letters of July 31, 2019 and August 8, 2019.

I deny defendants' request for leave to file motions to dismiss. Of course this is without prejudice to consider these matters at a later and more appropriate time.

Even were the outcome of the proposed motions favorable to defendants, it is not likely the scope of discovery would change. We all need to focus on the current important issues: how and why the contamination occurred and what the defendants knew about it.

We won't get sidetracked by extraneous issues. And we aren't going to trial on any unsupportable claims. Thank you.

Very truly yours,

s/Robert B. Kugler

Robert B. Kugler

United States District Judge